

Turkey

Improvement Plan

Thematic window: Youth, Employment & Migration

Programme Title: Growth with Decent Work for All: National Youth Employment Programme & Pilot Implementation in Antalya

c) File for the Joint Programme Improvement Plan

This file is used as the basis for establishing an improvement plan for the UNJP-YEM Turkey, which brings together all the recommendations, actions to be carried out by programme management during 2011-2012 in response to the evaluation.

Evaluation Recommendation No. 1						
UN engagement						
ISKUR / UN engagement present an effective case of partnership that promotes a multistakeholders approach, uses sustainable consultative planning processes and effective facilitation to promote understanding, collaboration and cooperation among partners. It needs to be replicated. This is recommended not only during planning but also during implementation. Monitoring and evaluation of the process of partnerships and its performance is equally important in order to learn and sustain the outputs of UNJP-YEM in Turkey.						
Response from the Joint Programme Management						
UN's working principle in Turkey is based on consultation and multistakeholder approach engaging various parties in planning, implementation and monitoring. This is made possible for other UNJP's through PMC mechanisms as well as continuous informal consultations. Consultative process is not limited to planning but continues throughout the implementation phase, at least on a quarterly basis through PMC meetings which monitor results and act as an assurance mechanism. Both the national and local level nature of the UNJP objectives has stimulated an efficient process of inter-institutional cooperation all through the program process. This dynamic process of collaboration has also emerged as a model which is intended to be replicated in the other provinces with high rate of youth unemployment.						
Key actions	Time frame	Person responsible	Follow-up		Secretariat	
			Comments	Status	Comments	Status
The results of the consultative process shared/ documented with examples from the UNJP and shared with external partners during the closing event	Q3-Q4	UNJP agencies		Ongoing		
Evaluation Recommendation No. 2						
Strengthen facilitation to building up stronger partnerships						
Develop systematic and comprehensive mechanism to involve stakeholders and build up strong partnership particularly in future areas targeted by ISKUR such as job counseling. For example partnerships with those closely related to ISKUR services/providers of counseling and job placement services (e.g. Antalya Commodity Exchange (ACE) and Antalya Metropolitan Municipality). Partnerships are also needed to sustain the tools and methods developed (e.g. with TURKSTAT, BATEM and Universities). Equally important are building partnerships between ISKUR and recruiting agencies, partnerships between national/local government and civil society. In this regard, build ISKUR capacity to facilitate and manage partnerships. For this purpose strengthens ISKUR capacity to use effective facilitation mechanisms that may require the following elements:						
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Involving local facilitator who commands the respect of stakeholders. He would facilitate processes, arrange for meetings, invite partners, persuade the value of attending, chair working groups and maintain momentum through and keeps track of on-going activities. Creating a mechanism and credibility for the partnership through formal or informal mandate: a mission statement, a legal/regulatory mandate, a memorandum of understanding or temporary initiative with time-bound objectives as needed. Increasing representation of private sector, particularly SMEs, civil society organizations, women and disadvantaged groups. Government participation needs to be limited to the highest possible level. Technical staff from ministries and local government entities in Antalya can be involved in working 						

groups.

- Adopting a balanced participation mechanism to carry out specific participatory processes. This will requires extending working groups to implement various activities.
- Sustaining partnership(s) with champions from both the government and private sector who invests in the process and drives it forward. Public sector champions as governors or mayors are most likely to be seen as taking an overall view of social benefits. They can, however give high-level political backing.
- Reaching out larger number of employers and building trust with the business community using a social marketing framework in order to achieve and sustain ISKUR objectives

Response from the Joint Programme Management

ISKUR and UNJP engagement is essential for the success of UNJP activities. On national level NTT created a unique model for participatory mechanisms whereas on local level individual partnerships in relevant activities have contributed to ensuring sustainability in the field and during the process of implementation. Cooperation with private sector, particularly with SMEs and SME host organisations like BATEM, ATSO, Exporters Association and sectoral associations as well as Regional Development Agency and academia during sector development studies will not only strengthen regional competitiveness but also leave concrete support schemes in place after the completion of UNJP.

The stakeholders in the city, i.e. the Governorate, Metropolitan Municipality, ATSO, City Council, NGOs, trade bodies and Chambers work very closely. There's an inclusive approach citywide, accompanied by willful participation.

Promoting and systematizing this approach, there also is a body in place called "PEVTB" Provincial Employment and Vocational Training Board chaired by the governorate which includes all relevant stakeholders in the city in which İŞKUR is a key member. With regard to recruiting agencies, they operate under ISKUR and report to ISKUR regularly

Key actions	Time frame	Person responsible	Follow-up		Secretariat	
			Comments	Status	Comments	Status
2.1 Further communication of ISKUR services including job counselling system to local stakeholders expedited	Q3-Q4	UNJP agencies		Ongoing		
2.2 Special trainings conducted for job counsellors and ISKUR Directorate on partnership building management and facilitation	Q3-Q4	UNJP agencies		Ongoing		

Evaluation Recommendation No. 3

Institutional alignment

In order to maximize the institutional potential, the partnership needs to continue being aligned within ISKUR as well as existing partner institutions. This requires UNJP_YEM Turkey to continue its strategic advice during the implementation of NYEAP in order to assist in improving the quality of implementation through capacity building as well as technical assistance, particularly in areas such as results-based management, project implementation, stakeholder's mobilization & facilitation.

Response from the Joint Programme Management

As communicated and documented to the evaluator both before and during the evaluation capacity development for implementation of the Action Plan is already in the work plan and will be implemented once the Action Plan is launched.

As communicated and documented to the evaluator before and during the evaluation, the UNJP participating

agencies and the partners are already involved in diverse forms of policy making processes related to youth employment and migration in Turkey such as providing strong agency/technical support to the NTT in the formulation of the NYEAP. Therefore a participatory and constant coordination mechanism is already in place and will be maintained throughout the implementation of the JP, which will also contribute to sustainability of the programme.

Key actions	Time frame	Person responsible	Follow-up		Secretariat	
			Comments	Status	Comments	Status
3.1 Strategic support to ISKUR continued focusing on results-based management, project implementation, stakeholder's mobilization and facilitation with a view to support implementation of NYEAP and enhancing capacity building	Q3-Q4	UNJP agencies		Ongoing		

Evaluation Recommendation No. 4

ISKUR staff TOT

The TOT is a critical element for the sustainability of UNDP-YEM Turkey. There is a need therefore to customize to ISKUR setting and needs of ISKUR staff. It may include redesign it to provide a trainer manual and a separate trainee's manual by considering a fourth module specifically focusing on teaching and training skills using available course material. The three trainers could participate in such fourth in order to provide participants with necessary feedback during the practice of learned presentation and teaching skills. The redesign is expected to be based on adult learning principles which mean that it is interactive, relevant and practical training that builds on what participants already know & experience. Thus, it requires that the trainer facilitate the learning experience in a motivational climate rather than serve in the more traditional role of an instructor or lecturer. And, to involves the use of behavior modeling (observational learning) to facilitate learning a standardized way of performing a skill or activity. In this way participants will acquire the new skills by observing others, perform the task with supervision & efficiently performs the newly acquired skills. It must be, also competency-based. This means that it emphasizes the assessment of learning to evaluate the participant based on how well he / she performs not just how much has been learned. Results of evaluation guide adaptation of the training to allow each participant to practice new skills until he/she becomes competent. By the time the training is complete, every participant should be able to perform every skill or activity competently. This is the ultimate measure of training.

Finally, the design should tailor the training program to the setting and needs of ISKUR staff and focus trainer's skills. (E.g. participants learn about and practice effective presentation skills in both classroom and small group situations; including practice teaching exercises that covers both issue-specific topics according participants' needs. A trainer manual must be developed as a "reference source" for the trainer. It will contain information that is consistent with the course goals and objectives. Thus, it will provide all of the essential information needed to conduct the course in a logical manner. The trainer's guide will contain the same material as the participant handbook as well as material for the trainer. This will include the pre-course questionnaire answer key, the mid-course questionnaire and answer key and competency-based qualification checklists. All training activities must be conducted in an interactive, participatory manner. The trainer role will continuously change throughout the course. He will act as an instructor when presenting a classroom demonstration; a facilitator/coach when working with teams or helping participants practice a specific skill; and an evaluator when objectively assessing participant performance.

The design of the training materials must pay particular attention to making them “user friendly” and to permit the participants and trainer the widest possible latitude in adapting the training to the participants’ (group and individual) learning needs. In this way developing a training package is essential. It must contain a trainer Guide containing teaching aids, exercises, audiovisual & competency-based performance evaluation forms to help the trainer conduct participatory training courses. In addition to a participant handbook containing an overview of the course, a validated questionnaire used to assess knowledge at the start of the course and self-assessment checklists which break down training skills into their essential steps and thirdly, a reference manual containing the background material.

Response from the Joint Programme Management

Design of the ToT was carried out in close cooperation with ISKUR with view to responding to the needs of the internal restructuring process of the UNJP as well as the institutional needs assessment study within UNJP. However it should be noted that it is a dynamic process enabling changes and revisions according to emerging needs of ISKUR. Indeed, the training programme has been updated/modified to address better the needs of the target group for the BLS trainings as well as matching and placement trainings.

Furthermore, a cascaded training programme has been developed by the academic trainers who have developed the basic life skills module for the most vulnerable groups of unemployed including migrant youth. It is aimed that the cascaded trainings will be delivered by ISKUR trained staff to a total of 1200 unemployed youth through 48 trainings. ISKUR staff has been directly involved in all the phases of both planning and implementation.

The mentioned items have been covered as a part of the applied Basic Life Skills training in Istanbul.

Establishment of a sustainable mechanism for the ISKUR staff who participated in the ToTs; and the need for the institutionalization of a ToT cycle is acknowledged in order to ensure a certain member of trainers’ availability in case of staff flows within ISKUR. Thus, the establishment of such a system in ISKUR through cascaded trainings will be advocated to ISKUR. In this context, it was recommended that a second set of cascaded trainings could be delivered by ISKUR’s existing job counsellors (the 30 people trained in ToTs) to newly recruited job counsellors through a mentoring system which will also add up to ISKUR’s institutional culture.

Key actions	Time frame	Person responsible	Follow-up		Secretariat	
			Comments	Status	Comments	Status
4.1 The trainer’s and trainee’s manuals continue to be re-visited for possible updates due to change in legislation, regulation or institutional restructuring	Q3-Q4	UNJP agencies and national partner				
4.1.1 ISKUR staff’s opinion as well as evaluation of the first round of ToT’s taken on revisions	Q3-Q4	UNJP agencies and national partner				
4.2 Cascaded trainings planned for new recruits of ISKUR to be delivered as 15 day training	Q3-4	UNJP agencies and national partner				

seminars by the trained staff of ISKUR (27 people trained through UNJP)						
---	--	--	--	--	--	--

Evaluation Recommendation No. 5

Assessment of capacity building activities

Ensure effectiveness of capacity building activities. This requires quantitative/qualitative assessment for each capacity building activity in three levels. The first level of such reports needs to assess participant's perceptions of the quality of the trainer or field visit, materials, and training facilities as well as their perceptions of how much they learned during the training experience. A Participant Satisfaction and Trainer Evaluation form will be prepared to be completed by each participant to evaluate satisfactory performance of the training/field visit. The level II evaluation must be keyed to the course objectives and emphasize the extent of acquiring/application the essential knowledge and skills needed and thirdly its organizational impact on ISKUR.

Response from the Joint Programme Management

For all capacity development programs conducted, level 1 evaluation is made through evaluation forms. The recommendations for other levels of evaluation are noted. On the other hand, the organizational impact of a single training program on ISKUR will be very difficult to assess and will not provide accurate results. The impact/improvement on ISKUR can only be assessed as the joint result of a number of capacity development initiatives.

Before the TOT programmes were developed, several methods of training needs analysis were conducted by respective trainers. Based on the outcome of the mentioned initiatives, the modules of the ToTs were developed.

Key actions	Time frame	Person responsible	Follow-up		Secretariat	
			Comments	Status	Comments	Status
5.1 Existing assessment methods to measure participant satisfaction and training effectiveness reviewed and improved as necessary to include ISKUR staff's efficiency as trainers	end October 2011 and then onwards	UNJP agencies and national partner		Ongoing		

Evaluation Recommendation No. 6

Communication and outreach

Ensure active communication the form of frequent interactions between ISKUR partners. Revisit the existing communication strategy and make it more structured and that it prioritizes key messages, existing partnership outputs and impact on targeted beneficiaries and providing opportunities to increase the commitment to the partnership. This would require considering a dissemination strategy to reach out larger number of employers and building trust with the business community in particular using a social marketing framework. It would, also requires additional management time in order to achieve and sustain ISKUR UNJP-YEM objectives.

Response from the Joint Programme Management

Periodical meetings and UNJP bulletins play important role in terms of sustainable communication among respective partners. UNJP visibility on online platforms (i.e. facebook, twitter, etc) will be encouraged. While Joint Coordination Meetings keeps Joint Programme's inter communication live, PMC meetings provides an efficient channel to maintain communication between the Joint Programme and ISKUR. Furthermore both JP bulletin (published 4 times a year) and JP web site provide up to date information to the relevant parties.

Communication Strategy that was prepared in the beginning stage of the JP. First year's communication and advocacy efforts were about presenting the JP to the relevant official and private sector stakeholders on national and local level as well as providing fundamental information about the JP and its targets and expected results.

The strategy was updated at the end of the year while taking expectations and work plan of the year 2 into consideration. After the approval of the year 2 communication strategy communication and advocacy activities emphasized on İŞKUR services and aimed at reaching the İŞKUR's main target groups namely job seekers and employers. In this context two big events have been organized in Ankara and Antalya in order to bring the head of İŞKUR with the national media (in Ankara) and employers and local media (in Antalya). Also new visibility materials have been developed and distributed.

In the year 3, which will last until September 2012, communication and advocacy efforts will focus on two points.

- 1- Advocacy efforts for National Youth Employment Action Plan
- 2- Advocacy and communication efforts on local level in order to make İŞKUR Antalya more visible and accessible as well as informing the target group about the JP activities and training in Antalya.

While working for these two targets along with other channels JP web site and new social media will also be used effectively. Also new printed material will be developed in order to reach the target group in Antalya. And last but not least In March 2012 JP will support and contribute the first Employment Fair that will be organised by İŞKUR in Antalya.

The donor contribution will also be communicated in a more visible way during these communication events.

Key actions	Time frame	Person responsible	Follow-up		Secretariat	
			Comments	Status	Comments	Status
6.1 Communication strategy revisited and revised if and as needed to accommodate the recommendations	until end November 2011	UNJP agencies and UNJP communication expert				

Evaluation Recommendation No. 7

Reporting and documentation

Regular reporting needs to be supporting by maintaining of accurate records that document the process and implementation of activities should be important. Accurate, agreed minutes are equally effective ongoing mechanism. This would allow the implementation process find the right path towards achieving its stated goals and learn from on-going progress.

Response from the Joint Programme Management

Regular, proper, timely and accurate reporting to PMC is ensured, and minutes are distributed after every meeting to all agencies, PMC members and other participants. JCMs and PMCs are held regularly, and frequent communication is an underlined issue by the management and the participating agencies. The level of reporting is at the optimum level, whereby effective use of resources are ensured.

Key actions	Time frame	Person responsible	Follow-up		Secretariat	
			Comments	Status	Comments	Status
Dissemination of the related activity reports and feedback mechanisms will continue	Continuous	UNJP Manager with the assistance from UNJP Assistant				

Evaluation Recommendation No. 8

Monitoring & Evaluation Framework

Review and revise UNJP-YEM monitoring framework, reformulate its results, corresponding indicators and assumptions and expand it to include assessment of UNJP-YEM partnership(s) and executed capacity building

activities. The revised monitoring & evaluation framework should provide a tool to organize results monitoring and evaluation processes, links what to monitor with how it will be done and used for baseline collection and, also for comparison with actual progress of UNJP-YEM. This requires, also reviewing its logical framework as well. The key elements of the monitoring and evaluation framework include:

- SMART-specific, measurable, achievable, relevant and time-bound results (impact statement, outcomes, outputs, activities) as defined by UNDP
- SMART-specific, measurable, attainable, relevant and time-bound performance
- indicators for the intervention to measure progress against each result, according to UNDP definition for the impact, outcomes and outputs indicators.
- Data sources
- Collection method
- Frequency of its collection
- Use of the data and the responsibility for collecting and analyzing it
- Baseline data

Targets that identifies specific planned level of results to be achieved within the duration of UNJP-YEM

Response from the Joint Programme Management

The UNJP has a very strong M&E structure reinforced by regular meetings and reports, which have been provided to the evaluator. Yet, the M&E framework has been revised considering the issues mentioned above. On the other hand, to ensure resource efficiency, indicators are based on existing data as opposed to new surveys, data collection, etc.

The UN M&E system will shortly undergo a review and capacity building process on M+E , in order to accurately measure UN system's contribution to the overall development goals of the country. This review will include JPs, which are a part of the UNDCS, common goals of the UN system.

Key actions	Time frame	Person responsible	Follow-up		Secretariat	
			Comments	Status	Comments	Status
M&E Framework will be reviewed with the considerations above	Q3-Q4	UNJP agencies and national partner				

Evaluation Recommendation No. 9

Monitoring & Evaluation function

Establishing a monitoring & evaluation function would allow for increased accountability, hence quality of outputs. The responsibility of the M&E function can be extended to developing a monitoring framework for the partnership(s) formed by ISKUR by imposing the identification of measurable and quantifiable outputs, therefore forcing a more strategic prioritization of issues. Integrated M&E could contribute significantly to a more strategic approach to the ISKUR partnership activities. Setting up Monitoring and evaluation system can be, in this case an effective tool to manage the partnership(s) process and to demonstrate its purpose and performance. It would encourage transparency; allow for increased accountability, hence quality of outputs. Developing a flexible, user-friendly process monitoring & impact evaluation framework would provide stakeholders with the ability to monitor internal processes, enable better overall planning that can ignite potential advocacy, and provide both internal and external motivation to promote more effective implementation. Monitoring partnership activities would allow learning that can be helpful in adjusting modes of operation and planning for the future through:

- Tracking the impact of each partnership-working group's work & the progress of issues being studied,
- Tracking the selection process of the partnership output (solution & reform proposals) generated by the partnership; from initial suggestions through to concrete recommendations, which could provide useful insights into the effectiveness of the suggestion filtering process
- Serve to promote transparency and build the legitimacy of final proposals by demonstrating how they came to be adopted

Tracking planning process for developing the implementation plan to show the ideal progression towards implementation and monitoring inputs (Financial & human resources).

Response from the Joint Programme Management

Improving the M&E system in ISKUR to become more functional and efficient is crucial to ensure effective and productive implementation of programs in place, and is already in the Joint Activities for the workplan as “Supporting establishment and capacity-building of İŞKUR’s new M&E Section for effective monitoring of the impact of new İŞKUR services and NAP implementation (Technical support to M&E section, needs assessment; training)”.

Once the institutional re-structuring of ISKUR is complete, a new M&E model can be developed. In this sense the technical and staff support have been approved.

The contribution of the Ministry of Development of Turkey to ISKUR’s M&E system is very important. It is also acknowledged that UNJP intervention at this level can be very helpful while ISKUR in preparing their triannual Strategic Plan, defining targets and identifying indicators to achieve these targets.

If the recommendation “Serve to promote transparency and build the legitimacy of final proposals by demonstrating how they came to be adopted” refers to ISKUR, all service providers are informed about the outcome of purchase of all services. Thus, the phrase should be rephrased accordingly.

Key actions	Time frame	Person responsible	Follow-up		Secretariat	
			Comments	Status	Comments	Status
The M&E related needs of ISKUR will be identified upon completion of the restructuring process and response will be developed jointly	2012-Q1	UNJP agencies and national partner				

Evaluation Recommendation No. 10

Implementation of NAP and moving forward

- Knowing that ISKUR has the funding to implement the plan, further technical assistance and training particularly in strengthening local partners, and facilitation may be required.

ISKUR needs to develop an effective & sustainable results-based management system aiming at improving management effectiveness and accountability of NAP needs to be immediately developed through a consultative process. It requires defining realistic expected results, monitoring progress toward the achievement of expected results, integrating lessons learned into management decisions and reporting on performance. It needs to be appropriate to the demand of all stakeholders involved. This will entail the design of a Performance Measurement Framework (PMF), Evaluation system, performance reporting mechanism, capacity building & support of organizational processes and dedicated core organizational resources for regular data collection, analysis and reporting for results. It may include, also M&E policies and procedures for learning and decision making.

Response from the Joint Programme Management

Noted. The capacity development response already identifies this as a need not only for implementation of the NYEAP but also to be more effective in service delivery. The JP management plans to include these in future training programs.

Key actions	Time frame	Person responsible	Follow-up		Secretariat	
			Comments	Status	Comments	Status
10.1 M&E Framework and reporting mechanism of NYEAP finalized and adopted along with the	December 2011 – January 2012	Related UNJP agencies, UNJP manager and ISKUR				

Plan						
10.2 Results based management trainings will be implemented upon completion of the restructuring process.	January 2012	Related UNJP Agencies and UNJP manager				
<p>Evaluation Recommendation No. 11</p> <p>Sustainability, exit strategy and extension of UNJP-YEM Turkey</p> <p>UNJP-YEM Turkey has successfully executed a number of activities that contributed positively to the sustainability of its results. Developing a sustainability strategy can equally provide a road map for ISKUR to sustain its activities and replicate Antalya model in other provinces.</p> <p>In order to ensure better functioning, better capacity building, transfer of competencies and replication of Antalya model, a phased approach to exit would, therefore reinforce UNJP-YEM Turkey in the mid-term.</p> <p>An extension of the program for six Months is, equally recommended particularly to ensure the quality of capacity building activities (e.g. TOT for ISKUR staff and training provided for other partners), provide additional module to enable participants to enhance their teaching, facilitation and counseling skills. In addition to assessing executed capacity building activities and vocational training. This requires developing an exit strategy to reinforce the proposed sustainability strategy.</p>						
<p>Response from the Joint Programme Management</p> <p>Noted.</p>						
Key actions	Time frame	Person responsible	Follow-up		Secretariat	
11.1 Sustainability Strategy developed and adopted by PMC	December 2011	Under UNJP Manager's leadership, all UN agencies and ISKUR	Comments	Status	Comments	Status
11.2 Work plan will be revisited to see if the funding structure will allow a no-cost extension	November 2011	Under UNJP Manager's leadership, all UN agencies				